

Kumekov B.E.¹, Kartova Z.K.²

¹Academician of the National Academy of Sciences of Kazakhstan, Doctor of Historical Sciences, al-Farabi Kazakh National University, International Institute of Kipchak Studies, Kazakhstan, Almaty, e-mail: bkumek@mail.ru

²Candidate of Historical Sciences, M. Kozybaev North Kazakhstan State University, Kazakhstan, Petropavlovsk, e-mail: kartov_m@mail.ru

THE SOURCE STUDY ANALYSIS AND CLASSIFICATION OF THE TARKHAN TYPE KHAN YARLYKS

The classification and systematization of the medieval act sources is the undeveloped direction in the domestic source studies. The article contains the source study analysis of a special type of act sources, also known in the scientific community as «tarkhanyarlyks». The tarkhanyarlyks are divided into three different subspecies. Moreover, the article provides a lot of scientific facts, that enable the identification of a social group known as «tarkhans». Their population size, assignment, position and status in the medieval society could be traced in the text of the tarkhanyarlyks. The classification of the tarkhanyarlyks on types and subtypes is also of the high importance as it will constitute the expansion of the medieval history sources.

Key words: tarkhan, yarlyks, source studies, medieval source, source classification.

Көмеков Б.Е.¹, Картова З.К.²

¹ҚР ҰҒА академигі, т.ғ.д., әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті, Халықаралық Қыпшақтану институты, Қазақстан, Алматы қ., e-mail: bkumek@mail.ru

²т.ғ.к., М. Қозыбаев атындағы Солтүстік Қазақстан мемлекеттік университеті, Қазақстан, Петропавл қ., e-mail: kartov_m@mail.ru

Хан жарлықтарының тархандық түрлерін деректанулық талдау және сыныптау

Отандық деректануда ортағасырлық акт деректерін жүйелеу және сыныптау мәселелері аз зерттелген бағыт. Мақалада ғылыми айналымда «тархан жарлықтары» деп аталатын акт деректердің ерекше тобына деректанулық сын жүргізілген. Тархан жарлықтары үш жеке топқа жіктелген. Сонымен қатар мақалада «тархан» деп аталатын әлеуметтік топты айқындайтын тарихи фактілер келтірілген. Тархан жарлықтарының мәтіндерінде сақталған мәліметтер бойынша тархандардың сандық құрамын, ортағасырлық қоғамдағы алатын орны мен статусын анықтауға болады. Тархан жарлықтарын топ пен түрлерге жіктеу ортағасырлық тарих бойынша дереккөздердің табиғатын анықтауға септігін тигізеді.

Түйін сөздер: тархан, жарлық, деректану, ортағасырлық деректер, деректерді жүйелеу, деректанулық сын.

Кумеков Б.Е.¹, Картова З.К.²

¹академик НАН РК, д.и.н., Казахский национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Международный институт кипчаковедения, Казахстан, г. Алматы, e-mail: bkumek@mail.ru

²к.и.н., Северо-Казахстанский государственный университет имени М. Козыбаева, Казахстан, г. Петропавловск, e-mail: kartov_m@mail.ru

Источниковедческий анализ и классификация тарханного вида ханских ярлыков

В отечественном источниковедении неразработанным направлением является классификация и систематизация актовых источников средневековья. В статье проведен источниковедческий анализ особого вида актовых источников, известных в науке как «тарханные ярлыки». Тарханные

ярлыки разделены на три отдельных подвида. Вместе с тем в статье приводятся научные факты, позволяющие выявить социальную группу людей, именуемых «тарханами». Их численный состав, формы произведения в тарханство, статус и положение тарханов в средневековом обществе можно проследить по тексту тарханных ярлыков. Важным также является классификация тарханных ярлыков по типам и видам с целью выявления характера источников по средневековой истории.

Ключевые слова: тархан, ярлык, источниковедение, средневековый источник, классификация источников, источниковедческая критика.

Tarkhanyarlyks were the first act sources that attracted the attention of the learned community. Sufficiently good coverage in the works of historians, philologists, orientalists received questions relating to the reconstruction of the contents of the text of the Tarkhanyarlyks. Their translation into Russian, a generalization of the material and an attempt to analyze the texts of yarlyks available in scientific round, were done in the works of I.N. Berezina, S.M. Shapshala, S.E. Malova, A.K. Borovkova, V.V. Velyaminov-Zernov, A.P. Grigoriev.

Studying tarkhanyarlyks, which were written throughout the Golden Horde during the XIV-XVI centuries, allows us to conclude that they were not homogeneous. In fact, we can talk about the existence of several subspecies of tarkhanyarlyks: tarkhanyarlyks issued to specific individuals and exempting them from taxes and duties; tarkhanyarlyks issued to Russian metropolitans, giving them tax and tax immunity; tarkhanyarlyks issued to individual cities and localities, while they were exempt from taxes and duties, etc.

The first group of tarkhanyarlyks was given to individuals for specific services to the ruler and the state. The Tarkhans, without the right to direct government, were exempted from numerous duties and taxes. Therefore, yarlyks were an official exemption of their owner from payment of all or major taxes. An example is Tarkhan literacy (to a specific person) – the yarlykof Timur-Kutlug to Hadji Mohammed and Mahmud (1398): «Duty from vineyards, ... barn duties, payment for barn, yask from irrigation ditches, collected from citizens on the layout, and the expenses, called the sea otter, are not charged; if they come to the Crimea and to Cafu or they leave again, and if they do not buy or sell anything there, they do not take any (heraldic duty) duties or weight from them, they do not demand from them either a road charge due from the Tarkhans and ministers, nor fees on guard. Let them not take cattle from the cattle, they do not appoint a standing, and do not require any food or fodder from them, but they will be free and protected from all oppression, expropriation and extraordinary taxes» (Radlov, 1888: 38). In the Tarkhanyarlyk of Timur-Kutluk

from 1398, this exemption is from 11 species, in the Sahib-Gireyyarlyk from 1523 – from 13 types of taxes (Muhamedyarov, 1967: 106). The content of benefits in yarlyks will vary depending on changes in real economic life. This most likely explained the fact that the yarlyks had to be constantly confirmed.

As for the quantitative ratio of tarkhanyarlyks in the total mass, it should be noted that there are significantly fewer than soyurgalicyarlyks, but they prevail in the family of preferential yarlyks. V. Ginz has counted only 14 complained tarkhanacts, but it is quite possible that there are a few more.

The Golden Tordanyarlyks in the original language (the Turkic language in the letters of the Uygur alphabet) have been preserved a little, the earliest of them dates back to 1381. Of the three yarlyks of the Golden Horde, two are tarkhanic, one diplomatic (bitik). These are the yarlyks of the khans of the Golden Horde of Timur-Kutluq Muhammad, dated April 1398, and Toktamysh Bek-Khadzhiy, issued in 1381 (Borovkov, 1966: 15).

In these yarlyks, a new form of legal relations is fixed and a new phenomenon – Tarkhanism, inherent in a nomadic society. Exemption from taxes and taxes provided an opportunity to move freely throughout the entire empire, which is very important for a nomadic society. And this rule of law is the main in the yarlyks of the period XIII-XV centuries. For example, in the yarlykof Timur-Kutluk: «if they come to the Crimea or Caffa or again leave», «they do not require a road toll from them» [Radlov 1888: 35]. In the Sahib-Girayayarlyk, the Tarkhans are exempted from taxes «on the roads and parking lots, on the way and at the place of stay, while finding them (somewhere) and departing» (Mukhamedyarov, 1967: 106). These yarlyks, in which these rights are fixed, can be considered as tarkhanic. Other varieties of yarlyks (soyurgalic, local, controlled, etc.) appear later and indicate a real change in the field of agrarian legal and other relationships.

Tarkhanyarlyks have a very important historical significance. I.N. Berezin notes the value of these yarlyks in the fact that «the names of different officials and estates listed in them make it possible

to reconstruct the hierarchy of the feudal estate, and the calculation of duties from which the tarkhans are exempt are indicative of public obligations towards the state. In the tarkhanicyarlyks we find a full or approximately full calculation of taxes and duties, taxes that were in the course of the Golden Horde» (Berezin, 1874: 301). Important information can be obtained from the Tarkhanyarlyks on the financial and tax system of the Golden Horde.

First discovering the yarlyks of the scientific community, I.N. Berezin calls them «tarkhanic». With regard to the Tarkhans themselves, he suggests that «judging by the fact that the calculation of duties in all yarlyks is the same, one can assume that the Tarkhans were of equal dignity and were equally exempt from numerous taxes. To the Tarkhans belonged privileged or free people (European missionaries are called barons). They fully owned all the prey that he got in battles and campaigns, had free access to the Khan's bid. Moreover, they were indulged in court only on the commission of nine crimes» (Berezin, 1851: 36).

However, this interpretation of the term «tarkhan» caused disagreement with him of many researchers. For example, V.D. Smirnov believed that the term «tarkhan» was borrowed «without any criticism and reasoning from his (I.N. Berezin-Z.K.), some incongruous Mongolian legends about the origin and meaning of the name of the tarkhan are taken for indisputable data that would satisfied academic curiosity as a scientific material or scientific argument. Hence it is necessary to sum up the facts and judgments by which the value of the Tatar Khan's yarlyks, commonly referred to as «tarkhanic», is determined, not limited to the generally accepted, so to say cognate, understanding of this word «[Smirnov 1913: 2]. In our opinion, the term «tarkhanic» is most consistent with this group of yarlyks, as it follows from the very content of the text and corresponds to the form of the document.

The term «tarkhan» was used in Turkic speaking tribes in a certain sense. In the inscription of Tonyukuk, the term «tarkhan» is found in the sense of a noble and honorable post. In the Uighur language, the «tarkhan» indicated the nobility of origin, in Chaghatay language it meant «the chosen person», i.e. enjoying a special honor and correspondingly significant privileges and privileges. In the etymological dictionary of Klausson the word «tarkhan» meant a post. In the Chinese sources, «tarkhan» is derived from «shan-yuy», «dan-ivai» – darkhan, tarkhan. Approximately the same value had this word among the ancient Mongols – darkhan, a

person exempt from paying taxes (Belyaev, 1850: 100).

In the manuscript book «Notes from the military fortress» Miran» a list of military and civil ranks is given. In the list next to the name is a rank, position or military rank, for example: apa-tarkhan (commander-in-chief), apa (commander), sanguine (commander), chur or shor (one of the highest titles of the ruler of ale), etc.» (Kuzembaev, 2001: 38). Later, the term «tarkhan» was used to refer to a certain category of persons who had written confirmation from the khanate government in the form of yarlyks on granting them special privileges. Ibn Fadlan, who visited the nomad camp of the Oguzes in 921-922, points out that the military leaders always had a certain circle of proxies in subjection. On the occasion of his arrival at the rate of the Arab Embassy, the leader «sent for him directly to the subordinate leaders, and they are the following: tarkhan, yinal ... and baglyz. And the Tarkhan was the most notable of them and the most outstanding of them» (Kuzembaev, 2001: 31).

Concerning this, Muhammad Haydar writes in more detail the following: «When he commits nine crimes, let him be brought to the court seat on horseback on a white horse-two-year-old, under the horse's feet let them throw nine white koshmas for exaltation (rider). His words let the khan (emir) pass the barlas. And the words of the khan brings to him from the eminence (where the Khan is sitting) another emir of barlas. When the interrogation is carried out in this way and his crime proves to be worthy of death, then after confirming the nine crimes let them make bleeding from the veins ...» (Pishchilina, 1977: 168).

A comparatively full description of the concept of «tarkhan» as a title is given by Abul-Ghazi, according to which the tarkhans possessed, in addition to exemption from taxes and duties, many other privileges. «Tarkhan means such a person,» Abul-Gazi wrote, «from which tribute is not taken; when he comes to the Khan's house, no one can stop him; enters and leaves at will. If he makes a crime, then up to nine guilts are not collected from him; after the ninth he is already recovered. This right also passes to his offspring up to the ninth kind» (Pishchilina, 1977: 167). The author does not call these rights tarkhanic, but, in essence, they are such.

V.V. Barthold noted that «the granting of an individual to Tarkhanism was the exception of this person from the subordinate class and its elevation to the nobility.» V.V. Barthold considered the land and property exempt from taxes to be a tarkhan and pointed out that the title «tarkhan» was very

common among the Turkic peoples (Barthold 1993: 180-182). A.N. Bernshtam pointed to another feature, which is apparent in the monuments of ancient Turkic writing, namely the prefix «beg» to the title of «Tarkhan»: «... we are dealing with individuals who have the right to gather in this case natural duties» (Kuzembaev, 2001: 37).

In the social differentiation of Kazakh society up to the first half of the XVIII century, the Tarkhans took priority place and played a significant role in the socio-political life of the society. Tarkhans in the nomadic society enjoyed greater political rights, even compared to biys and batyrs. On the importance of Tarkhanism in the Kazakh society Rychkov wrote: «Tarkhanism is in all the steppe peoples and there is a certain degree of the principality. In the people if they do not exceed, then they are not inferior to the power of the khan.» Here N.P. Rychkov is referring to Daut-tarkhan, the son of the first tarkhan, Zhanybek-batyr. In August 1742, in Orsk fortress, with the reception of the khan, sultans, biys and batyrs of the Younger Zhuz, the head of the Orenburg expedition I.I. Neptyuev appropriated the title of the first tarkhan, Zhanybek-batyr. In the decree on conferring the Tarkhan title Zhanibek it was said: «For the faithful service and the true loyalty of Abulkhair Khan and between the Kirghiz-Kaisak people the first tarkhan and descendants who will serve faithfully and will be the Tarkhans in the camp at Orsk fortress on August 30, 1742» [Pischulina 1969: 75]. This was not the only time when the tsarist government began to appropriate the Tarkhan title to Kazakh biyas and batyrs in the 50s of the XVIII century. But if in the period of the Golden Horde the Tarkhans were granted tax-paying immunity, then it had a completely different social significance in the Kazakh society.

The second subspecies of Tarkhanyarlyks XIII-XVI centuries. is best known in the scientific world as khan's yarlyks issued to Russian metropolitans in the period from 1267 to 1379. These khan's yarlyks are Russian translations of Golden Horde letters. All of them are given by Tatar hansha and khans and provided immunity and various privileges for the Russian Orthodox Church. Their study is justified, since the benefits from taxes and dues, determined in immunity letters, were necessary to preserve the inviolability of church land ownership. Some of these yarlyks, which were kept in the archives of the Russian Metropolitans, were translated from the Uighur language into Russian in the late 14th and early 15th centuries and provided with an afterword. So there was a short collection of yarlyks, which includes:

1. The yarlyk of Khan Muhammad Byulek (Tulunbek), issued in February 1379 to Metropolitan Michael.

3. Yarlyk of Mengu-Timur to Metropolitan Kirill, issued on August 10, 1267 goda.

4. Passing the charter of hanishi Taiduly, issued on February 10, 1354 to Metropolitan Alexy.

5. The yarlyk of Khan Berdibek to Metropolitan Alexy, issued in November 1357.

6. The gratuitous charter of Tayduly, issued on February 4, 1351 to Metropolitan Theognostus.

7. Conclusion from the originator of the meeting (Grigoriev, 2004: 5-7).

High-quality translation of these documents testifies to the development of practical diplomacy in Russia in the 14th-15th centuries. A short collection of yarlyks was first published in 1792 as part of the Lvov Chronicle (Priselkov, 1916: 57). However, the researchers were not interested in this edition of the yarlyks and preferred to use a lengthy collection of these documents, known since 1788 by N.I. Novikova (Grigoriev, 2004: 29). Taking as a basis the publication of N.I. Novikova, V.V. Grigoryev devoted a special study of the authenticity of Khan's yarlyks issued to the Russian clergy.

A classic example of this subspecies of Tarkhan letters is the yarlyk of Mengu-Timur, which contains a list of taxes and fees levied in favor of the Golden Horde treasury, and the payment of which freed the servants of the Orthodox Church: «... they do not need to pay tribute to the tamga and the cavity food ... some tsar's toll neither the tsarina nor the princes nor the row of either the ambassador or the road, nor the ambassador, nor any customs, nor any income ...» (Veselovsky, 1917: 122).

According to the content of the texts, the construction of the form they are similar to the tarkhanic, which were given to specific individuals, at the same time have their own textual features. So, for example, only in this subset of yarlyks can you find a complete list of princely degrees. Since in the texts of yarlyks the ranks of the clergy stand in a conspicuous place, it means that they have an important role in the state. In addition, according to the content of the texts of yarlyks, we can judge about the spiritual hierarchy of the Russian church. With the development of statehood, the authority of the church increased, as we find evidence in the Khan's yarlyks. Russian Metropolitans also made a lot of efforts to get privileges from the Khans of the Golden Horde. It is not for nothing that in the forged yarlyk of Uzbek Khan Metropolitan Peter added that «Metropolitan Peter himself rules his people and judges them in all matters, not excluding criminal

ones, that all ecclesiastical lands must obey him» [Priselkov 1916: 36-38].

The third subspecies of Tarkhanyarlyks appeared in connection with the change in land relations. Both the farmers and the nomads of the Mongolian possessions were well aware of the Tarkhan institution of entire cities and localities. Among the large feudal landowners in the Timurid state of the second half of the 15th century, a very prominent group was occupied by a group of so-called «tarkhans». They enjoyed their privileges by inheritance and concentrated in their hands together with the rights of a large landowner – the rights of the ruler. Some of the most influential Tarkhans controlled very significant areas (Miankal, Tashkent, Bukhara, etc.), using almost complete independence (Pischulina, 1969: 40). The legal basis for the emergence of this form of land ownership was the same Khan's yarlyks, which provided for great benefits. As a rule, recipients of yarlyks along with special political privileges possessed many property and land rights.

The land, owned by the Tarkhans, was almost always exempt from taxes and duties brought in favor of the khan's treasury. In this respect, the yarlyks of the Khans of the Golden Horde, issued to vassals, are characteristic, both in nomadic and in sedentary areas. In the Tokhtamysh-Khan yarlyk, issued in 1381 to the feudal Bek-hodzhe, the leader of the Shurakul steppe tribe, we are dealing with the grant of predominantly pasture land. In the yarlyk itself it is indicated that the Shurakul nomad tribe headed by Bek-hodja paid a tax every year and received other duties in favor of the khan's treasury.]. Since the receipt of the yarlyk, it has been exempted from them, as the yarlyk was instructed: «From the houses of the Shurakul tribe, taxes are not collected, there is no compulsion to pursue the chase, no charges are demanded on grain stores, no officials, whoever they are for the Shurakul, will whether they wander inside or outside the Crimea, as free from the head of the region, it is not necessary to have any business, with the general migration of the taxation, it is not only to harm but to protect and guard the evil, and to all of them to roam along with Khodzhi-bek» (Pishchulina, 1969: 46). Apparently, the same was the «decree on Tarkhanism» issued by Emir Timur to one of the opponents of Tokhtamysh named Kunge-oglan. Moreover, the right of Tarkhanism was also enjoyed by his tribe (il) (Barthold, 1963: 565).

If we take into account that Tarkhanism complained not only to individuals, but also to the population of entire localities, it is possible to single

out a group of yarlyks – legal acts that exempt entire cities or areas from taxes. There are many evidences to that. For example, Ibn Battuta, who visited the Golden Horde in the first half of the fourteenth century, describing the city of Astrakhan (Haji-Tarkhan), explains that «the sultan Uzbek Khan, out of respect for one pious Turkic Haji, exempted his village from all taxes and taxes» (Shapshal 1953: 310). «Tarkhan means a place taken from taxes. This city received its name from the Turkic Haji (pilgrim), one of the pious who settled in this place. The Sultan gave this place to him duty-free, and it became a village; then it increased and became a city» (Shapshal, 1953: 311).

The information of Ibn Battuta is valuable in that they speak of the presence of feudal land relations and private ownership of land among nomads who inhabited the region of the future Astrakhan. If Uzbek Khan took the areas of Astrakhan hodge, got the rank of tarkhan, having freed his land from taxes and duties, apparently, in other cases he did not release from feudal duties in favor of the khan, the owner of the land. Otherwise there would be no need to give out yarlyks. Thus, Ibn-Battuta pointed out that the entire city of Astrakhan was in this case a tarkhan. This explains, perhaps, the word «tarkhan» that often occurs in the names of localities. In Turkestan, a place called Tarkhan-Sayad is known, in the Penza region there is a village of Tarkhany, in the Crimea there are frequent localities with the names of Tarkhan-Kut, Tarkhan-Skrygel, Alma-Tarkhan, etc. All these areas with khans used tarkhan law (Shapshal, 1953: 309). The right of Tarkhanism was given to entire monasteries in Rus (this can be judged by the metropolitan yarlyks) or to the local population (Veselovsky, 1917: 119-120).

There are many yarlyks issued by khans to the residents of the Kryk-Yer area. Obviously, the basis was the desire to accustom the nomads to sedentary life or to populate this uninhabited, but strategically important valley, in which the capital of the Khanate was later built. The granted Tarkhanism extended to everyone who wished to «settle in Kryk-Ere» (Shapshal, 1953: 315). Thus, only for the «Crimean period» we have several yarlyks to the population of Kryk-Yer (Hadji-Giray, November 1469, Mengli-Girey, July 1468, he also, April-March 1479, Muhammad-Girey, May 1515) (Barthold, 1993: 33-35). Being, as a matter of fact and content, tarkhanicyarlyks, they represent some kind of them, since in essence they open a new institute of nomadic law. This is confirmed in the studies of Academician V.V. Barthold, who reported the following: «Massive Tarkhanism of

the inhabitants of the whole city, of course, was originally not meant, but this way of liberation from taxes and duties of the residents of the capital was subsequently applied to Uzbeks. At the end of the XVIII century. Shah Murad and Emir Malsum, zealous adherents of the Sharia, at the beginning of their reigns, declared the Tarkhans for their release from taxes and duties, that is, they resorted not to the norm of Sharia, but to the norm of nomadic law» (Barthold, 1993: 38).

In scientific round there is another subspecies of Tarkhanyarlyks, which were issued by khans or Crimean governors of the Golden Horde to the Black Sea Italian cities of Kafa and Tana (Azak). The original of these yarlyks were lost and preserved only in modern Latin and Italian translations of documents of the 14th century. Modern Latin and Italian translations of Turkic-speaking yarlyks, issued by the rulers of the Golden Horde to the Genoese of the city of Cape and the Venetians of

the city of Tana in the period 1333-1381, represent the most valuable material for the history of both the Black Sea Italian colonies and the Golden Horde. I. Vashari works on the critical edition of Latin and Italian texts with translations and comments, as well as on the issues of intensive involvement of these texts in scientific round. It is about twelve tarkhanyarlyks, translations of four of them are preserved in Latin, eight – in Italian (Va: 2002: 195-196).

Thus it should be noted that the Tarkhanyarlyks are valuable sources on the history of socio-economic relations. Firstly, on the basis of their study, a new type of nomadic law will be revealed – the Tarkhan Institute. Secondly, it will be possible to trace the origins and continuity in the evolution of the sources of act sources. It is also important to classify tarkhanyarlyks according to kinds and types, which will serve as an extension of sources according to medieval history.

References

- Bartold V.V. (1993) Tyurki: Dvenadtsat lektsiy po istorii i turetskikh narodov Sredney Azii. Almaty
Bartold V.V. Toktamyshe. T.5. S. 564-567.
- Berezin I.N. (1874) Ocherki vnutrennego ustroystva Ulusa Dzhuchiyeva. Sankt Peterburg.
- Berezin I.N. (1851) Khanskiye yarlyki II. Tarkhannye yarlyki Tokhtamysha, Timur-Kutluka i Saadet-Gireya. Kazan.
- Borovkov A.K. (1966) Opyt filologicheskogo analiza tarkhannykh khyarlykov, vydannykh russkim mitropolitom. // IAN SSSR. Seriya literatury i yazyka. T. 25. Moskva. s.13-24.
- Grigor'yev A.P. (2004) Sbornik khanskikh arlykov russkim mitropolitom. Sankt Peterburg.
- Kuzembayev N.Ye. (2001) Analiz sotsial'noy titulatury drevnikh tyurkov. // Kazakstan tarikhny men etnologiyasynun maseleleri. Karaganda, s. 35-39.
- Mukhamed'yarov Sh.F. (1967) Tarkhanny yarlyk kazanskogo khana Sakhib-Gireya 1523g. // Novoy o proshlom nashey strany. Pamyati akademika M.N. Tikhomirova. Moskva. s.104-109
- Pishchulina K.A. (1977) Yugo-Vostochnyy Kazakhstan v seredine XIV–nachale XVI vv. Alma-Ata, Priselkov M.D. (1916) Khanskiye yarlyki russkim mitropolitom. Sankt Peterburg.
- Veselovskiy N.I. (1917) Rets.na kn.: Priselkov M.D. Khanskiye yarlyki russkim mitropolitom. // ZHMNP. Novaya seriya. CH. 68. №3-4. S. 118-130.
- Pishchulina K.A. (1969) Prisyrdar'inskiye goroda i ikh znacheniy v istorii kazakhskikh hkanstv v XV– XVII vv. // Kazakhstan v XV–XVIII vekakh (voprosy sotsial'no-politicheskoy istorii). Alma-Ata, S. 5-49.
- Radlov V.V. (1888) Yarlyki Tokhtamyshai Temir-Kutluka. // ZVO(I)RAO T. 3, 2. Sankt Peterburg. s.1-40.
- Shapshal S.M. (1953) K voprosu o tarkhannykh hyarlykakh. // Akademiku B.A. Gordlevskomu k 75-letiyu. Moskva. S. 302-316.
- Smirnov V.D. (1913) Krymsko-khanskiye gramoty. Simferopol.
- Belyayev I.D. (1850) O mongol'skikh chinovnikakh, upominayemykh v khanskikh yarlykakh. // Arkhiv istoriko-yuridicheskikh vedeniy, odnosyashchikhsya k Rossii. Kn. 1. s. 97-110.
- Vashari I. (2002) Zhalovannye gramoty Dzhuchiyeva Ulusa, dannye ital'yanskim gorodam Kafa i Tana. // Istochnikovedeniye istorii Ulusa Dzhuchi (Zolotoy Ordy. Ot Kalki do Astrakhani. 1223-1556.) Kazan.

Литература

- Радлов В.В. (1888) Ярлыки Тохтамыш и Темир-Кутлука. // ЗВО(И)РАО. Т. 3, вып. 1-2. – Санкт-Петербург с.1 – 40.
- Мухамедьяров Ш.Ф. (1967) Тарханный ярлык казанского хана Сахиб-Гирея 1523 г. // Новое о прошлом нашей страны. Памяти академика М.Н.Тихомирова. Москва. с.104-109
- Боровков А.К. (1966) Опыт филологического анализа тарханных ярлыков, выданных русским митрополитом. // ИАН СССР. Серия литературы и языка. Т. 25. Москва. с. 13-24.
- Березин И.Н. (1874) Очерки внутреннего устройства Улуса Джучиева. Санкт-Петербург.
- Березин И.Н. (1851) Ханские ярлыки II. Тарханные ярлыки Тохтамыш, Тимур-Кутлука и Саадет-Гирея. Казань.

- Смирнов В.Д. (1913) Крымско-ханские грамоты. Симферополь.
- Беляев И.Д. (1850) О монгольских чиновниках, упоминаемых в ханских ярлыках. // Архив историко-юридических сведений, относящихся к России. Кн. 1. с. 97-110.
- Кузембаев Н.Е. (2001) Анализ социальной титулатуры древних тюрков. // Қазақстан тарихы мен этнологиясының мәселелері. Караганда. с. 35-39.
- Пищулина К.А. (1977) Юго-Восточный Казахстан в середине XIV–начале XVI вв.– Алма-Ата. – 287 с.
- Бартольд В.В. (1993) Тюрки: Двенадцать лекций по истории турецких народов Средней Азии. – Алматы. –192 с.
- Григорьев А.П. (2004) Сборник ханских ярлыков русским митрополитам. Санкт-Петербург 270 с.
- Приселков М.Д. (1916) Ханские ярлыки русским митрополитам. Санкт-Петербург
- Веселовский Н.И. (1917) Рец. на кн.: Приселков М.Д. Ханские ярлыки русским митрополитам. // ЖМНП. Новая серия. Ч. 68. № 3 – 4.– С. 118-130.
- Пищулина К.А. (1969) Присырдарьинские города и их значение в истории казахских ханств в XV– XVII вв.// Казахстан в XV–XVIII веках (вопросы социально-политической истории). Алма-Ата. С. 5-49.
- Бартольд В.В. Токтамыш. – Т. 5. С. 564-567.
- Шапшал С.М. (1953) К вопросу о тарханных ярлыках. // Академику Б.А. Гордлевскому к 75-летию. Москва. с. 302-316.
- Вашари И. (2002) Жалованные грамоты Джучиева Улуса, данные итальянским городам Кафа и Тана. // Источниковедение истории Улуса Джучи (Золотой Орды. От Калки до Астрахани. 1223-1556.) Казань 432с.