

Ali Rıza Tosun¹, Karataiev O.²

¹Assistant Prof. Dr., e-mail: biltar@hotmail.com

²Prof. Dr., e-mail: okaratayev@gmail.com

Kastamonu University, Art and Science Faculty, Department of Philosophy, Turkey, Ankara

**Comparing *dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* and
lexicon in accordance with beginning letter aleph**

In this study two dictionaries compared in accordance with headwords beginning with letter aleph, the one is Kaşgarlı Mahmud's dictionary which is called *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* that was completed nearly 1077 and the other one is Sir James W. Redhouse's *A Turkish and English Lexicon* which was published in 1890. Our study yielded the following conclusions: *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* and Redhouse's *Lexicon* have 93 common words in terms of orthography and meaning that is given in the table. In the writing of *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* words, the harakat (movements) carry almost the same function that letters carry. But in Redhouse's *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* there is a tendency to write words without the need for harakat.

Key words: Turkish Orthography, Linguistic, Dictionary, Historical Lexicography, Kaşgarlı Mahmud, *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk*, W. Redhouse's *A Turkish and English Lexicon*, *Kāmūs-i Türkī*

Али Риза Тосин¹, Қаратаев О.²

¹қауымдастырылған профессор, e-mail biltar@hotmail.com ²профессор, e-mail okaratayev@gmail.com
Костомону университеті, өнер және ғылым факультеті, философия департаменті, Түркия, Анкара қ.

**Әліпби жазуының басталуына сәйкес
диуани Лұғат-ат-Түрік пен лексиконды салыстыру**

Бұл зерттеуде әліпби әріптерінен басталатын бас әріптерге сәйкес екі сөздікке салыстырмалы талдау жасалған. Оның бірі 1077 жылы жазылған Махмуд Қашқаридың Диуани Лұғат-ат-Түрік сөздігі болса, екіншісі – 1890 жылы жарық көрген сэр Джеймс У. Редхауздың түрік және ағылшын лексиконы болды. Зерттеуден келесідей қорытынды жасалды: Диуани Лұғат-ат-Түрік пен Редхауздың лексиконында кестеде көрсетілгендей, орфографиясы мен мағынасы бойынша 93 ортақ сөз кездеседі. Диуани Лұғат-ат-Түрікте сөз жазғанда харакаттың (әрекет) қызметі әріптермен бірдей. Ал Редхауздың «Лексиконы» мен Камус-и Туркте харакатсыз сөз жазу кездеседі.

Түйін сөздер: түрік орфографиясы, лингвистика, сөздік, тарихи лексикография, Махмуд Қашқари, Диуани Лұғат-ат-Түрік, У. Редхаус, Түрік және ағылшын лексиконы, Камус-и Турк.

Али Риза Тосин¹, Каратаев О.²

¹ассоциированный профессор, e-mail biltar@hotmail.com ²профессор, e-mail okaratayev@gmail.com
Университет Кастомону, факультет искусств и науки, департамент философии, Туркия, г. Анкара

**Сравнение дивани Лугат-ат-Турк и лексикон
в соответствии с началом письма алипби**

В этом исследовании два словаря сравнивались в соответствии с заглавными буквами, начинающимися с буквы алфавита, одним из которых является словарь Кашгари Махмуда, который называется Дивани Лугат-ат-Турк, который был написан почти в 1077, а другой – турецкий и английский лексикон сэра Джеймса У. Редхауза который был опубликован в 1890 году. Наше исследование дало следующие выводы: Дивани Лугат-ат-Турк и лексикон Редхауза имеют 93 общих слова с точки зрения орфографии и значения, которые приведены в таблице.

При написании слов Дивани Лугат-ат-Турк харакат (движения) несут почти ту же функцию, что и буквы. Но в «Лексиконе» Редхауса и Камус-и Турка есть тенденция писать слова без необходимости хараката.

Ключевые слова: турецкая орфография, лингвистика, словарь, историческая лексикография, Кашгари Махмуд, Дивану Лугат-ат-Турк, У. Редхаус Турецкий и английский лексикон, Камус-и Турк.

Introduction

In this study two dictionaries compared in accordance with headwords beginning with letter aleph, the one is Kaşgarlı Mahmud's dictionary which is called *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* that was completed nearly 1077 and the other one is Sir James W. Redhouse's *A Turkish and English Lexicon* which was published in 1890.

Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk's original manuscript has lost but a copy of it was produced by Muhammad of Save in 1266 is survived. The manuscript is bought by Ali Emiri in 1912 and then printed in three volumes between 1915 and 1917 by Kilisli Rifat Bilge. Besim Atalay is translated it to modern Turkish with an index in 1939-1941. In Atalay's index words are only ordered by latin alphabet. In addition to this black and white facsimile of the manuscript was printed in 1941. After that Dehri Dilçin was prepared another index ordered by arabic alphabet referencing to Atalay's translation. Robert Dankoff, James Kelly are translated and printed the book to English between 1982 and 1985 in three volumes. In the book they use detailed transcription characters and index ordered by in accordance with their transcription system. In 1990 Ministry of Cultural Affairs reprinted the manuscript colorful exact copy in 1990. Finally in 2008 Ministry of Culture and Tourism is printed the manuscript again under the title of *Kitābu Divānu Lugāti't-Türk, Tıpkıbasım – Türkçe Sözcükler, Özel Adlar Dizini*. This edition contains an index for Turkish words and proper names ordered by Arabic alphabet in referencing to directly manuscript page numbers. For this reason in our study we use this edition and its index.

For the Sir James W. Redhouse's *A Turkish and English Lexicon* we use Librairie du Liban edition printed in 1987.

Method

Firstly to be able to compare two dictionaries we extracted Lexicon's headwords which begins with aleph, aleph with madda above and its definitions. Then, the extracted headwords and their definitions placed in an excel file. While

placing headwords, lexical categories which are abbreviations, transcriptions, definitions, part of speech elements thought as a single unit and located consecutive separate cells and columns. As a result of this we obtained categorized and structured data. In this process we encountered some issues that we have to decide one way or the other. Some headwords consist of two or three words like this *ابريشم ibrişim*, *اساور اساوره esāvīr*, *اساوره esāvīr*, *اساور اساور esāvīr*, *اوتان utan*, *اوتانج utanc*. In these situations we accept the first word as a headword and referenced the other word or words to headword *اساوره esāvīr: see اساور esāvīr*, *اساوره esāvīr: see اساور esāvīr*, *اوتانج utanc: see اوتان utan*. This decision changes the dictionary's original headwords number but enable us to comparing other dictionaries using computer software programs. After that we arranged the *Lexicon* in accordance with Persian alphabetical order because there is no option for original Ottoman Turkish alphabetical order in MS Excel or Libreoffice Calc. We thought that to write code for arranging Ottoman Turkish alphabetical order but it makes the issue more complicate and cannot useable ready-made software's. For this reason we decided to continue to using Persian order.

Secondly from index of 2008 edition of *Kitābu Divānu Lugāti't-Türk* we extracted words beginning with aleph and aleph with madda above. Then the words placed excel file referenced with manuscript page numbers, then ordered by Persian order. Then colonized the column without short vowel marks which is called *harakat* (movements).

Thirdly we compared two columns and get 978 common words. But these words occur more than ones and some words meaning different from in the Lexicon's meaning so they are cleaned out. Eventually we obtained 93 common words that have same orthography, same pronunciation and same meaning between Redhous's Lexicon and *Kitābu Divānu Lugāti't-Türk*.

Finally we put them into the table with referencing to manuscript page and line numbers, English translations, Turkish, Transcription, with Arabic letters and images taken from manuscript. That table is given below.

Common Words Redhouse's <i>Lexicon</i> and <i>Dīvānu Lugātī't-Türk</i>						
	Page – Line	English	Turkish	Transcription	Arabic	Image
1	p. 163: ln: 9; p. 12: ln: 16	horse	at	at	آت	
2	p. 227: ln: 15; p. 52: ln: 5; p. 228: ln: 2	hungry	aç	ac	آج	
3	p. 565: ln: 17; p. 56: ln: 9	bee	arı	arı	آرى	
4	p. 328: ln: 17; p. 53 ln: 3; p. 187 ln: 6	eat, food	aş	aş	آش	
5	p. 167: ln: 5; p. 43 ln: 15	deceive, trick	al	al	آل	
6	p. 253: ln: 10; p. 54: ln: 2	moon	ay	ay	آى	
7	p. 29: ln: 12; ...	flesh	et	et	ات	
8	p. 89: ln: 10; ...	dog	it	it	ات	
9	p. 46: ln: 14; ...	skirt	etek	etek	اتك	
10	p. 87: ln: 8	skirting	eteklik	eteklik	اتكلك	
11	p. 22; 23	İtil (Volga) River	itil	itil	اتل	
12	p. 98 ln: 10	fleshy	etli	etli	اتلى	
13	p. 42: ln: 3	bread	etmek	etmek	اتمك	
14	p. 291 ln: 7	baker	ekmekci	etmekci	اتمكى	
15	p. 12: ln: 16	male, man	er	er	ار	
16	p. 30: ln: 6	shame, embarrass	ır	ır	ار	
17	p. 74: ln: 14	an army, a camp	ordu	ordu	اردو	
18	p. 42: ln: 14	warp (vertical) of carpet or rug loom	arış	eriş	ارش	
19	p. 47: ln: 4	plum	erik	erük	ارك	
20	p. 68: ln: 11; ...	male, man	erkek	erkek	اركك	
21	p. 87: ln: 8	an orchard of plum-trees	eriklik	erüklük	اركلك	
22	p. 66: ln: 17	early	erken	erken	اركن	
23	p. 132: ln: 13	a mass of stagnant water	irkinti	irkindi	اركندى	
24	p. 65: ln: 4	male humanity	erlik	erlik	ارلك	
25	p. 87: ln: 11	spider	örümcek	örümcek	ارمچك	

<i>Table continuation</i>						
26	p. 82: ln: 4	a gift, present, offering	armağan	armağan	ارمغان	
27	p. 30: ln: 5	one who has arrived at the truth, who has obtained a spiritual union with God	eren	eren	ارن	
28	p. 53: ln: 1	footmark, scraping, erasure	iz	iz	از	
29	p. 48: ln: 1	crushed, bruised, squashed	ezik	ezik	ازك	
30	p. 72: ln: 13	wish, desire, inclination, appetite	istek	istek	استك	
31	p. 67: ln: 7	upper, superior, dominant	üstün	üstün	استن	
32	p. 44: ln: 1	drunk, violent	esrik	esrük	اسرك	
33	p. 77: ln: 7	old, second-hand, worn	eski	eski	اسكى	
34	p. 43: ln: 1	hale; healthy, well, sound, robust	esen	esen	اسن	
35	p. 71: ln: 13; p. 87: ln: 17 ...	(in plural form اشلار eşlär) fellow, mate, one of a pair	eşler	eşler	اش	
36	p. 566: ln: 14	young, boy	uşak	uşak	اشاق	
37	p. 33: ln: 9	threshold	eşik	eşik	اشك	
38	p. 67: ln: 10	trot, quick pace	eşkin	eşkin	اشكن	
39	p. 67: ln: 11	cavalry postmen	eşkinçi	eşkinçi	اشكنجى	
40	p. 160: ln: 13	son, swarm of bees	oğul	oğul	اغل	
41	p. 28: ln: p. 39: ln: 3	good luck, weal	uğur	uğur	اغور	
42	p. 37: ln: 11	advice; counsel	öğüt	öğüt	اكت	
43	p. 39: ln: 5	sweet flag, acorus calamus	eğir	eğir	اكر	
44	p. 76: ln: 2	crooked, curved, bent	eğri	eğri	اكرى	
45	p. 83: ln: 10	twin	ikiz	ikkiz	اكز	
46	p. 65: ln: 11	deficient, less, absent, lacking	eksik	eğsük	اكسك	
47	p. 51: ln: 15	shoulder blade, scapula	eğin	eğin	اكن	
48	p. 373: ln: 11	The afternoon Muslim service of divine worship, secondary	ikindi	ikindi	اكندى	














































						<i>Table continuation</i>
49	p. 224: ln: 7	ox	öküz	öküz	اکوز	
50	p. 32: ln: 17; p. 471: ln: 9	hand, with hand	el	elig	ال	
51	p. 53: ln: 16	leprous, spotted white and black	ala	ala	الا	
52	p. 73: ln: 15	courier, post horse	ulak	ulag	الاغ	
53	p. 175: ln: 10	great, big, large	ulu	ulug	الغ	
54	p. 49: ln: 3	marrow	ilik	ilik	الك	
55	p. 33: ln: 15	first	ilk	ilk	الك	
56	p. 77: ln: 14	apple	elma	alma	الما	
57	p. 31: ln: 11	medicine	em	em	ام	
58	p. 31: ln: 5	now, at present	imdi	emdi	امدى	
59	p. 49: ln: 5	the young of a carnivorous beast, a pup, whelp, cub	enik	enük	انك	
60	p. 524: ln: 13	accusative of he, she, it	onu	anı	انى	
61	p. 27: ln: 2	house, home	ev	ev	او	
62	p. 37: ln: 8	yes	evet	evet	اوت	
63	p. 33; ln: 17	herb, weed, plant	ot	ot	اوت	
64	p. 118; ln: 8	shame, fault	utun	ötün	اوتون	
65	p. 34: ln: 3	revenge	öç	öc	اوج	
66	p. 34: ln: 6	extremity, end	uç	uc	اوج	
67	p. 10 ln: 4	striking, hitting, beating, slaughtering	uruş	uruş	اورش	
68	p. 34: ln: 14	öz: self, essence	öz	öz	اوز	
69	p. 34: ln: 13	üz: crease	üz	üz	اوز	
70	p. 15: ln: 11; p. 8: ln: 17	ok: arrow	ok	oğ	اوق	
71	p. 35: ln: 14	understanding, reason, breast, chest, bosom	ög	ög	اوک	
72	p. 61: ln: 2	orphan, bewildered	öksüz	ögsüz	اوکسز	

Table continuation

73	p. 7: ln: 7	owl	ügi	ügi	اوكى	
74	p. 14: ln: 14	he, she, it	ol	ol	اول	
75	p. 36: ln: 2	wet, muddy	öl	öl	اول	
76	p. 313: ln: 3; p. 50: ln: 16	they	onlar	olar	اولار	
77	p. 44: ln: 11	be, hapened	olan	olan	اولان	
78	p. 46: ln: 7	gutter, trough	oluk	oluğ	اولق	
79	p. 35: ln: 10	death	ölüm	ölüm	اولوم	
80	p. 36: ln: 8	a rounded prominence; a protuberance	um	um	اوم	
81	p. 36: ln: 8	ten	on	on	اون	
82	p. 36: ln: 9	voice, sound	ün	ün	اون	
83	p. 36: ln: 9	flour	un	un	اون	
84	p. 50: ln: 1	ho! hola!	ay	ay	ای	
85	p. 81: ln: 6	rib	eyeğü	eyeğü	ایکو	
86	p. 32: srt 16	work	iş	iş	ایش	
87	p. 236: srt 4	worker	işçi	işci	ایشچی	
88	p. 55: ln: 7	spindle	iğ	iğ	ایک	
89	p. 36: ln: 6; p. 78: ln: 7; p. 124: ln: 3	two	iki	iki	ایکی	
90	p. 34: ln: 7	tribe, people, nation; especially, a subdivision of a great general tribe	il	il	ایل	
91	p. 79: ln: 6	curse, imprecation	ilenc	ilenc	ایلنج	
92	p. 36 ln: 12	den, resort of wild beasts	in	in	این	
93	p. 69 ln: 1	belief, faith, trust	inan	inan	اینان	

Conclusion

Redhouse's *Lexicon* printed in 1890 in İstanbul, Kaşgarlı Mahmud's *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* was prepared today's Kirgızistan, Uygur and from there to almost Mediterranean Sea and was presented to Caliph in 1077 in Bagdad¹. Orthographically and















semantically unchanged 93 words proof us Turkish speaking people is used these words in 813 years and except a few of them still using today. This means that there is a strong and live continuity and connection, so we can calculate concretely the continuity from linguistic materials especially historical dictionaries.


As in our example there are some words do not change orthographically in time but some others change orthographically and semantically what


¹ Ercilasun, Ahmet B. – Akkoyunlu Ziyat, (çevirenler) Kaşgarlı Mahmud Divānu Lugāti't-Türk Giriş – Metin – Çeviri – Notlar – Dizin. Türk Dil Kurumu Yayınları, Ankara 2014, p. xx.


is/are the reason/reasons of it? What is the percentage of rate of change? If we look at *Kāmūs-i Türkī* and *Lexicon* we will see that there are many


common words having same meaning *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* with small orthographical changes. For example:

	Dict.	English	Transcription	Arabic	Dict.	Page – Line	Transcript.	Image
1	KT	open	açmak	أچمق	DLT	p. 92 line 4	acmak	
2	KT	rise	ağmak	أغمق	DLT	p. 96 line 15	ağmak	
3	KT	ayran	ayran	أیران	DLT	p. 73 line 5	ayran	
4	KT	game	oyun	اویون	DLT	p. 55 line 8	oyun	
5	KT	to crush	itişmek	ایتشمک	DLT	p. 100 line 2	itişmek	
6	KT	to catch cold	üşütmek	اوشوتمک	DLT	p. 114 line 2	üşütmek	
7	Lex.	bite	ısırmak	ایصرمق	DLT	p. 98 line 17	ısırmak	
8	Lex.	forget	unutmak	اونوتمق	DLT	p. 115 line 13	unıtmak	
9	Lex.	transfer	ahtarmak	أخترمق	DLT	p. 117 line 9	ahtarmak	
10	Lex.	barley	arpa	آرپا	DLT	p. 74 line 8	arba	
11	Lex.	duck	ördek	اوردک	DLT	p. 74 line 13	ördek	
12	Lex.	inner garment	içlik	ایچلک	DLT	p. 64 line 3	iclik	
13	Lex.	tall	uzun	اوزون	DLT	p. 51 line 6	uzun	
14	Lex.	bitterness	acılık	أجیلق	DLT	p. 86 line 5	acıklık	

Even from this small samples we can infer some clues: the first one is at the beginning a word *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* uses ا aleph fetha above giving “a or e” voice except for in a few example  ayran, but *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* use systematically ا aleph with madda above for “a” voice, ایران ayran.

The second one is at the beginning a word *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* uses ا aleph kasra below giving “ı, i” voice  itişmek, but *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* use systematically ا aleph and yeh for “ı, i” voice, ایتشمک itişmek.

The third one is at the beginning a word *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* uses ا aleph damma above giving “u, ü, o, ö” voice  ördek, but *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* use systematically او aleph and waw for “u, ü, o, ö” voice, اوردک ördek.

The fourth one is in the middle of word *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* usually uses ا aleph for giving “a” voice  ağmak, but *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* usually do not use ا aleph for giving “a” voice, اغمق ağmak.

The fifth one is in the middle of word *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* usually uses ُ harakat damma for

giving “u, ü, o, ö” voice **اوزون** uzun, but *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* usually use و waw for giving “u, ü, o, ö” voice, **اوزون** uzun.

The sixth one is in the middle of word *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* usually uses َ harakat kasra for giving “ı, i” voice **اچغلق** acıgılığ *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* usually use ی yeh for giving “ı, i” voice, **اچیلق** acılığ.

These examples indicates that orthography had changed in time, of course all languages and orthographies more or less change in the long run. But how we can trace back the process of changing, revealing the structure of process and deducing rules if there are. In our opinion, historical dictionaries, especially their common words must come together side by side with their periods and different orthographies, this enable us to see differences and similarities, from these we can deduce rules or widespread usages or preferences.

In Turkish language history there are many dictionaries, we cannot ignore any of them because every dictionary gives us information about something we do not know, even the worst dictionaries can sometimes give us some information that we cannot find in the best dictionaries. However, it is also clear that starting with the most common and most effective dictionaries will yield more accurate and reliable results. For these reason in our study we mainly use *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk*, Redhouse's *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī*.

Our study yielded the following conclusions: *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* and Redhouse's *Lexicon* have 93 common words in terms of orthography and meaning. In the writing of *Dīvānu Lugāti't-Türk* words, the harakat carry almost the same function that letters carry. But in Redhouse's *Lexicon* and *Kāmūs-i Türkī* there is a tendency to write words without the need for harakat.

References

- Atalay, Besim (1985) (çeviren), *Divānu Lugāti't-Türk Tercemesi I-III*, Türk Dil Kurumu, Ankara 1985
- Atalay, Besim (1986) (çeviren), *Divānu Lugāti't-Türk Dizini “Endeks” (IV)*, Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- Bilge, Kılıslı Rıfāt (Hazırlayan) *Divānu Lugāti't-Türk I-II* (1915), II (1917).
- Dankoff, Robert – Kelly, James. (1982-1985). *Türk Şiveleri Lügatı (Compendium of Turkic Dialects) – Dīvānu Luğat-it-Türk- / İnceleme – Tenkidli Metin – İngilizce Tercüme – Dizinler*, Yayınlayan: Şinasi Tekin, Gönül Alpay Tekin, Harvard Üniversitesi Basımevi I. Kısım: 1982, II. Kısım: 1984, III. Kısım: 1985.
- Kurt, Şaban, (Hazırlayan) (2008). *Kitābu Divāni Luğāti't-Türk Tıpkıbasım-Türkçe Sözcükler, Özel Adlar Dizini, Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı Yayınları*, Ankara.
- Ercilasun, Ahmet B. (2014). – Akkoyunlu Ziyat, (çevirenler) Kaşgarlı Mahmud *Divānu Lugāti't-Türk Giriş – Metin – Çeviri – Notlar – Dizin*. Türk Dil Kurumu Yayınları, Ankara.
- Redhouse, Sir James W. (1987). *A Turkish and English Lexicon*, İstanbul 1890, New Impression Librairie du Liban.
- Samî, Şemseddin. (1996). *Kāmūs-i Türkî*, 7. bs., Çağrı Yayınları, İstanbul.
- Yavuzarslan, Paşa. (2010). (Latin Harflerine Çeviren, Hazırlayan) *Kāmūs-i Türkî Şemseddin Sami -*, Türk Dil Kurumu Yayınları, Ankara.